Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Mohit Garu

S/o Dalip Kumar, # B-2/698/6-E, Chhawani Mohalla, District Ludhiana-141008

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3599 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Mohit Garu (Appellant) 97791-11717 Vimal Kumar, Inspector, Zone-D (for the Respondent) 88473-86805

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **29.7.2020** vide which the appellant, who is a student, has sought information <u>regarding temporary workers etc. in Zone-B wards between 2017 and 2020 in five points</u>, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **9.9.2020**, and Second Appeal was filed in the Commission on **19.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at Deputy Commissioner's Office, Ludhiana. The PIO has contended that the information sought by the appellant is voluminous and therefore cannot be furnished.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO to file a written, pointwise reply to each of the points on this RTI application, along with the requested information. The PIO may cite specific provisions of RTI Act 2005 for points where he seeks exemption from disclosure. The appellant is requested to make a written submission demonstrating the 'larger public interest' that would be served by the disclosure of the information he has requested.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3599 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Mohit Garu

S/o Dalip Kumar, # B-2/698/6-E, Chhawani Mohalla, District Ludhiana – 141 008

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3600 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Mohit Garu (Appellant) 97791-11717 Vimal Kumar, Inspector, Zone-D (for the Respondent) 88473-86805

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **29.7.2020** vide which the appellant, who is a student, has sought information **regarding workers etc in Zone-A wards**, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **9.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **19.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. The PIO has contended that the information sought by the appellant is voluminous and therefore cannot be furnished.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO to file a written, point-wise reply to each of the points on this RTI application along with the requested information. The PIO may cite specific provisions of RTI Act 2005 for points on which he seeks exemption from disclosure. The appellant is requested to make a written submission demonstrating the 'larger public interest' that would be served by the disclosure of the information he has requested.
- 4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3600 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Mohit Garu

S/o Dalip Kumar, # B-2/698/6-E, Chhawani Mohalla, District Ludhiana – 141 008

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3601 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Mohit Garu (Appellant) 97791-11717 Rajiv Bhardwaj, PIO-cum-Superintendent (Respondent) 96460-08499

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **29.7.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information regarding officials and other employees working in Ward No. 3 of Zone-D, along with names, designations date of joining etc., as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **9.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **19.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at Deputy Commissioner's Office, Ludhiana. The respondent PIO-cum-Superintendent, Zone-D, Rajiv Bhardwaj, stated that a reply vide Letter No. 72/RTI/SZF dated 7.10.2020 was sent to the appellant along with the information requested. The appellant however, contended deficiencies with respect to point 2of his RTI application.
- 3. The respondent PIO is directed to submit a duly notarised affidavit bearing the reply already sent to the appellant. The original affidavit is to be handed over to the appellant and a copy be sent to this Commission.
- 4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3601 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. The respondent PIO is also directed to put a list of all employees (regular, temporary and outsourced) working in the Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana, with details of salary etc. on the official website of the Corporation. Such a list must be prominently displayed and regularly updated every six months or annually. This is in keeping with Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act, 2005, which reads as under:

Section 4. Obligations of public authorities.—

- (1) Every public authority shall—
- (a) maintain all its records duly catalogued and indexed in a manner and the form which facilitates the right to information under this Act and ensure that all records that are appropriate to be computerised are, within a reasonable time and subject to availability of resources, computerised and connected through a network all over the country on different systems so that access to such records is facilitated;
- (b) publish within one hundred and twenty days from the enactment of this Act,—
- (i) the particulars of its organisation, functions and duties;
- (ii) the powers and duties of its officers and employees:
- (iii) the procedure followed in the decision making process, including channels of supervision and accountability;
- (iv) the norms set by it for the discharge of its functions;
- (v) the rules, regulations, instructions, manuals and records, held by it or under its control or used by its employees for discharging its functions;
- (vi) a statement of the categories of documents that are held by it or under its control;
- (vii) the particulars of any arrangement that exists for consultation with, or representation by, the members of the public in relation to the formulation of its policy or implementation thereof;
- (viii) a statement of the boards, councils, committees and other bodies consisting of two or more persons constituted as its part or for the purpose of its advice, and as to whether meetings of those boards, councils, committees and other bodies are open to the public, or the minutes of such meetings are accessible for public;
- (ix) a directory of its officers and employees;
- (x) the monthly remuneration received by each of its officers and employees, including the system of compensation as provided in its regulations:
- (xi) the budget allocated to each of its agency, indicating the particulars of all plans, proposed expenditures and reports on disbursements made;

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3601 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- (xii) the manner of execution of subsidy programmes, including the amounts allocated and the details of beneficiaries of such programmes;
- (xiii) particulars of recipients of concessions, permits or authorisations granted by it;
- (xiv) details in respect of the information, available to or held by it, reduced in an electronic form;
- (xv) the particulars of facilities available to citizens for obtaining information, including the working hours of a library or reading room, if maintained for public use;
- (xvi) the names, designations and other particulars of the Public Information Officers;
- (xvii) such other information as may be prescribed, and thereafter update these publications every year;
- (c) publish all relevant facts while formulating important policies or announcing the decisions which affect public;
- (d) provide reasons for its administrative or quasi judicial decisions to affected persons.
- (2) It shall be a constant endeavour of every public authority to take steps in accordance with the requirements of clause (b) of sub-section (1) to provide as much information suo motu to the public at regular intervals through various means of communications, including internet, so that the public have minimum resort to the use of this Act to obtain information.
- (3) For the purpose of sub-section (1), every information shall be disseminated widely and in such form and manner which is easily accessible to the public.
- (4) All materials shall be disseminated taking into consideration the cost effectiveness, local language and the most effective method of communication in that local area and the information should be easily accessible, to the extent possible in electronic format with the Central Public Information Officer or State Public Information Officer, as the case may be, available free or at such cost of the medium or the print cost price as may be prescribed.

Explanation.—For the purposes of sub-sections (3) and (4), "disseminated" means making known or communicated the information to the public through notice boards, newspapers, public announcements, media broadcasts, the internet or any other means, including inspection of offices of any public authority.

6. The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation Ludhiana is, herewith, directed to report compliance of the direction contained in paragraph 5 of this Order, within 45 days.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3601 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

7. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Chandigarh 5.3.2021

Cc: Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana for Compliance.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Mohit Garu

S/o Dalip Kumar, # B-2/698/6-E, Chhawani Mohalla, District Ludhiana – 141 008

Versus

Public Information Officer, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation,

Ludhiana.

First Appellate Authority,
o/o Commissioner,
Municipal Corporation,
Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3602 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Mohit Garu (Appellant) 97791-11717 Balwinder Singh, PIO-cum-SDO, Zone-D (for the Respondent) 96460-57981

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **29.7.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding the staff in the O&M Branch of Zone-D**, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **9.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **19.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at Deputy Commissioner's Office, Ludhiana. The respondent PIO-cum-SDO, Zone-D, Balwinder Singh, stated that the information was sent to the appellant vide Letter No. 18/APIO/D on 1.3.2021. The appellant stated that he is satisfied with the information supplied to him pertaining to points 1, 3, and 5. He however, says that information pertaining to points 2 and 4 is deficient. The appellant is requested to list deficiencies in writing in a letter to the respondent PIO with a copy to this Commission.
- 3. The respondent PIO is directed to submit a response to the deficiencies listed by the appellant along with the requested information or cite provisions of the RTI Act 2005, if he seeks exemption from disclosure.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3602 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. The respondent PIO is also directed to put a list of all employees (regular, temporary and outsourced) working in the Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana, with details of salary etc. on the official website of the Corporation. Such a list must be prominently displayed and regularly updated every six months or annually. This is in keeping with Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act, 2005, which reads as under:

Section 4. Obligations of public authorities.—

- (1) Every public authority shall—
- (a) maintain all its records duly catalogued and indexed in a manner and the form which facilitates the right to information under this Act and ensure that all records that are appropriate to be computerised are, within a reasonable time and subject to availability of resources, computerised and connected through a network all over the country on different systems so that access to such records is facilitated;
- (b) publish within one hundred and twenty days from the enactment of this Act,—
- (i) the particulars of its organisation, functions and duties;
- (ii) the powers and duties of its officers and employees;
- (iii) the procedure followed in the decision making process, including channels of supervision and accountability;
- (iv) the norms set by it for the discharge of its functions;
- (v) the rules, regulations, instructions, manuals and records, held by it or under its control or used by its employees for discharging its functions;
- (vi) a statement of the categories of documents that are held by it or under its control;
- (vii) the particulars of any arrangement that exists for consultation with, or representation by, the members of the public in relation to the formulation of its policy or implementation thereof;
- (viii) a statement of the boards, councils, committees and other bodies consisting of two or more persons constituted as its part or for the purpose of its advice, and as to whether meetings of those boards, councils, committees and other bodies are open to the public, or the minutes of such meetings are accessible for public;
- (ix) a directory of its officers and employees;
- (x) the monthly remuneration received by each of its officers and employees, including the system of compensation as provided in its regulations;

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3602 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- (xi) the budget allocated to each of its agency, indicating the particulars of all plans, proposed expenditures and reports on disbursements made;
- (xii) the manner of execution of subsidy programmes, including the amounts allocated and the details of beneficiaries of such programmes;
- (xiii) particulars of recipients of concessions, permits or authorisations granted by it;
- (xiv) details in respect of the information, available to or held by it, reduced in an electronic form;
- (xv) the particulars of facilities available to citizens for obtaining information, including the working hours of a library or reading room, if maintained for public use;
- (xvi) the names, designations and other particulars of the Public Information Officers;
- (xvii) such other information as may be prescribed, and thereafter update these publications every year;
- (c) publish all relevant facts while formulating important policies or announcing the decisions which affect public;
- (d) provide reasons for its administrative or quasi judicial decisions to affected persons.
- (2) It shall be a constant endeavour of every public authority to take steps in accordance with the requirements of clause (b) of sub-section (1) to provide as much information suo motu to the public at regular intervals through various means of communications, including internet, so that the public have minimum resort to the use of this Act to obtain information.
- (3) For the purpose of sub-section (1), every information shall be disseminated widely and in such form and manner which is easily accessible to the public.
- (4) All materials shall be disseminated taking into consideration the cost effectiveness, local language and the most effective method of communication in that local area and the information should be easily accessible, to the extent possible in electronic format with the Central Public Information Officer or State Public Information Officer, as the case may be, available free or at such cost of the medium or the print cost price as may be prescribed.

Explanation.—For the purposes of sub-sections (3) and (4), "disseminated" means making known or communicated the information to the public through notice boards, newspapers, public announcements, media broadcasts, the internet or any other means, including inspection of offices of any public authority.

6. The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation Ludhiana is, herewith, directed to report compliance of the direction contained in paragraph 5 of this Order, within 45 days.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3602 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

7. Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Mohit Garu

S/o Dalip Kumar, # B-2/698/6-E, Chhawani Mohalla, District Ludhiana – 141 008

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3603 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Mohit Garu (Appellant) 97791-11717 Vimal Kumar, Inspector, Zone-D (for the Respondent) 88473-86805

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **29.7.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information regarding sweepers working ward-wise in Zone-D, in five points, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **9.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **19.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. The PIO has contended that the information sought by the appellant is voluminous and therefore cannot be furnished.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO to file a written, point-wise reply to each of the points on this RTI application along with the requested information. The PIO may cite specific provisions of RTI Act 2005 for points on which he seeks exemption from disclosure. The appellant is requested to make a written submission demonstrating the 'larger public interest' that could be served by the disclosure of the information he has requested.
- 4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3603 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. The respondent PIO is also directed to put a list of all employees (regular, temporary and outsourced) working in the Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana, with details of salary etc. on the official website of the Corporation. Such a list must be prominently displayed and regularly updated every six months or annually. This is in keeping with Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act, 2005, which reads as under:

Section 4. Obligations of public authorities.—

- (1) Every public authority shall—
- (a) maintain all its records duly catalogued and indexed in a manner and the form which facilitates the right to information under this Act and ensure that all records that are appropriate to be computerised are, within a reasonable time and subject to availability of resources, computerised and connected through a network all over the country on different systems so that access to such records is facilitated;
- (b) publish within one hundred and twenty days from the enactment of this Act,—
- (i) the particulars of its organisation, functions and duties;
- (ii) the powers and duties of its officers and employees:
- (iii) the procedure followed in the decision making process, including channels of supervision and accountability;
- (iv) the norms set by it for the discharge of its functions;
- (v) the rules, regulations, instructions, manuals and records, held by it or under its control or used by its employees for discharging its functions;
- (vi) a statement of the categories of documents that are held by it or under its control;
- (vii) the particulars of any arrangement that exists for consultation with, or representation by, the members of the public in relation to the formulation of its policy or implementation thereof;
- (viii) a statement of the boards, councils, committees and other bodies consisting of two or more persons constituted as its part or for the purpose of its advice, and as to whether meetings of those boards, councils, committees and other bodies are open to the public, or the minutes of such meetings are accessible for public;
- (ix) a directory of its officers and employees;
- (x) the monthly remuneration received by each of its officers and employees, including the system of compensation as provided in its regulations;

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3603 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- (xi) the budget allocated to each of its agency, indicating the particulars of all plans, proposed expenditures and reports on disbursements made;
- (xii) the manner of execution of subsidy programmes, including the amounts allocated and the details of beneficiaries of such programmes;
- (xiii) particulars of recipients of concessions, permits or authorisations granted by it;
- (xiv) details in respect of the information, available to or held by it, reduced in an electronic form;
- (xv) the particulars of facilities available to citizens for obtaining information, including the working hours of a library or reading room, if maintained for public use;
- (xvi) the names, designations and other particulars of the Public Information Officers;
- (xvii) such other information as may be prescribed, and thereafter update these publications every year;
- (c) publish all relevant facts while formulating important policies or announcing the decisions which affect public;
- (d) provide reasons for its administrative or quasi judicial decisions to affected persons.
- (2) It shall be a constant endeavour of every public authority to take steps in accordance with the requirements of clause (b) of sub-section (1) to provide as much information suo motu to the public at regular intervals through various means of communications, including internet, so that the public have minimum resort to the use of this Act to obtain information.
- (3) For the purpose of sub-section (1), every information shall be disseminated widely and in such form and manner which is easily accessible to the public.
- (4) All materials shall be disseminated taking into consideration the cost effectiveness, local language and the most effective method of communication in that local area and the information should be easily accessible, to the extent possible in electronic format with the Central Public Information Officer or State Public Information Officer, as the case may be, available free or at such cost of the medium or the print cost price as may be prescribed.

Explanation.—For the purposes of sub-sections (3) and (4), "disseminated" means making known or communicated the information to the public through notice boards, newspapers, public announcements, media broadcasts, the internet or any other means, including inspection of offices of any public authority.

6. The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation Ludhiana is, herewith, directed to report compliance of the direction contained in paragraph 5 of this Order, within 45 days.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3603 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

7. Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Mohit Garu

S/o Dalip Kumar, # B-2/698/6-E, Chhawani Mohalla, District Ludhiana – 141 008

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3604 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Mohit Garu (Appellant) 97791-11717 Vimal Kumar, Inspector, Zone-D (for the Respondent) 88473-86805

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **29.7.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding sweepers working ward-wise in Zone-C, in five points**, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **9.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **19.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. The PIO has contended that the information sought by the appellant is voluminous and therefore cannot be furnished.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO to file a written, point-wise reply to each of the points on this RTI application along with the requested information. The PIO may cite specific provisions of RTI Act 2005 for points on which he seeks exemption from disclosure. The appellant is requested to make a written submission demonstrating the 'larger public interest' that could be served by the disclosure of the information he has requested.
- 4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3604 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. The respondent PIO is also directed to put a list of all employees (regular, temporary and outsourced) working in the Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana, with details of salary etc. on the official website of the Corporation. Such a list must be prominently displayed and regularly updated every six months or annually. This is in keeping with Section 4(1)(b) of the RTI Act, 2005, which reads as under:

Section 4. Obligations of public authorities.—

- (1) Every public authority shall—
- (a) maintain all its records duly catalogued and indexed in a manner and the form which facilitates the right to information under this Act and ensure that all records that are appropriate to be computerised are, within a reasonable time and subject to availability of resources, computerised and connected through a network all over the country on different systems so that access to such records is facilitated;
- (b) publish within one hundred and twenty days from the enactment of this Act,—
- (i) the particulars of its organisation, functions and duties:
- (ii) the powers and duties of its officers and employees;
- (iii) the procedure followed in the decision making process, including channels of supervision and accountability:
- (iv) the norms set by it for the discharge of its functions;
- (v) the rules, regulations, instructions, manuals and records, held by it or under its control or used by its employees for discharging its functions;
- (vi) a statement of the categories of documents that are held by it or under its control;
- (vii) the particulars of any arrangement that exists for consultation with, or representation by, the members of the public in relation to the formulation of its policy or implementation thereof;
- (viii) a statement of the boards, councils, committees and other bodies consisting of two or more persons constituted as its part or for the purpose of its advice, and as to whether meetings of those boards, councils, committees and other bodies are open to the public, or the minutes of such meetings are accessible for public:
- (ix) a directory of its officers and employees;
- (x) the monthly remuneration received by each of its officers and employees, including the system of compensation as provided in its regulations;

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3604 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- (xi) the budget allocated to each of its agency, indicating the particulars of all plans, proposed expenditures and reports on disbursements made;
- (xii) the manner of execution of subsidy programmes, including the amounts allocated and the details of beneficiaries of such programmes;
- (xiii) particulars of recipients of concessions, permits or authorisations granted by it;
- (xiv) details in respect of the information, available to or held by it, reduced in an electronic form;
- (xv) the particulars of facilities available to citizens for obtaining information, including the working hours of a library or reading room, if maintained for public use;
- (xvi) the names, designations and other particulars of the Public Information Officers;
- (xvii) such other information as may be prescribed, and thereafter update these publications every year;
- (c) publish all relevant facts while formulating important policies or announcing the decisions which affect public;
- (d) provide reasons for its administrative or quasi judicial decisions to affected persons.
- (2) It shall be a constant endeavour of every public authority to take steps in accordance with the requirements of clause (b) of sub-section (1) to provide as much information suo motu to the public at regular intervals through various means of communications, including internet, so that the public have minimum resort to the use of this Act to obtain information.
- (3) For the purpose of sub-section (1), every information shall be disseminated widely and in such form and manner which is easily accessible to the public.
- (4) All materials shall be disseminated taking into consideration the cost effectiveness, local language and the most effective method of communication in that local area and the information should be easily accessible, to the extent possible in electronic format with the Central Public Information Officer or State Public Information Officer, as the case may be, available free or at such cost of the medium or the print cost price as may be prescribed.

Explanation.—For the purposes of sub-sections (3) and (4), "disseminated" means making known or communicated the information to the public through notice boards, newspapers, public announcements, media broadcasts, the internet or any other means, including inspection of offices of any public authority.

6. The Commissioner, Municipal Corporation Ludhiana is, herewith, directed to report compliance of the direction contained in paragraph 5 of this Order, within 45 days.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3604 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

7. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Surjit Singh Whistle Blower,

S/o Kulvir Singh, # 2990/76, Street No. 4, Guru Gobind Singh Nagar, Near Mair Di Chakkit, Post Office Daba, District Ludhiana – 141 003

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3705 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

(Appellant) Absent

Dr. Vipal Malhotra, PIO-cum-Health Officer (Respondent) 97800-11515

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **28.8.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information regarding medicines and other supplies etc for the Covid 19 Pandemic, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **28.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **24.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. The appellant is absent without information. The respondent PIO-cum-Health Officer, Dr. Vipal Malhotra, present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana, stated that a reply vide Letter No. 6680 dated 18.9.2020, was sent to the appellant asking him to deposit the cost of photocopying the information he had requested. However, the said letter, rather strangely, does not mention the amount to be deposited. This RTI application was submitted more than six months ago, on 28.8.2020, during which time, the respondent PIO failed to convey the cost of copying to the appellant.
- 3. Under the circumstances, this Commission directs the respondent PIO to file a written pointwise reply to this RTI application along with copies of the requested information which must be attested as per the format given below.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3705 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Surjit Singh Whistle Blower,

S/o Kulvir Singh, # 2990/76, Street No. 4, Guru Gobind Singh Nagar, Near Mair Di Chakkit, Post Office Daba, District Ludhiana – 141 003 Versus

Public Information Officer (Headquarters),

o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Commissioner, Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3706 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

(Appellant) Absent Ajay Kumar, Building Inspector, Zone-A (for the Respondent) Rohit Thakur, Clerk, Zone-B (for the Respondent) Inderjit Singh, Head Draftsman, Zone-C (for the Respondent) Harjeet Singh, Draftsman, Zone-D (for the Respondent)

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **28.8.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding vehicle dealerships in Zone-A,B,C and D,** as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **28.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **24.11.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. The appellant is absent without intimation. The respondent PIO, represented by Ajay Kumar, Building Inspector, Zone-A, Rohit Thakur, Clerk, Zone-B, Inderjit Singh, Head Draftsman, Zone-C, and Harjeet Singh, Draftsman, Zone-D, are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. They have stated that separate replies were sent to the appellant on various dates.
- 3. The Commission notes that this RTI application was filed to the PIO, office of Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana, who has not replied, and has instead tried to pass buck to subordinate officials of the zonal offices.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3706 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- 4. The Commission directs the respondent PIO-cum-Superintendent (Headquarter), **Sh. Rohit Sahota**, to collect all the information/replies from the 4 zones and supply the appellant a comprehensive, single, pointwise reply / information with a copy to this Commission. Failure to comply with this order, will invite penalties under the RTI Act, 2005.
- 5. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

6. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Rohit Sabharwal,

S/o Vijay Sabharwal, # 126, Model Gram, District Ludhiana – 141 002

Versus

Public Information Officer (Headquarters), o/o Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Municipal Corporation, District Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3809 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Sukhjinder Kaur (for the Appellant) Surinder Singh, XEN, Zone-A (for the Respondent) Harjit Singh, SDO, Zone-B (for the Respondent) Kulwinder Singh, SDO, Zone-C (for the Respondent)

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **8.8.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding roads in the City**, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **17.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **4.12.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. The appellant is represented by his lawyer Sukhjinder Kaur. The respondent PIO is represented by Surinder Singh, XEN Zone-A, Harjit Singh, SDO Zone-B, and Kulwinder Singh, SDO Zone-C. The Commission notes that separate replies have been sent to the appellant from the various zones, which has caused considerable confusion like in many other RTI applications submitted to the MC Ludhiana. This RTI application was submitted to PIO (Headquarters), who in the present instance is, **Sh. Rohit Sahota**, Superintendent.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO (Headquarters) to file a written comprehensive, point-wise reply along with the requested information after duly attesting it in the format prescribed below. The respondent PIO is also to examine deficiencies already listed by the appellant to the First Appellate Authority on 24.10.2020 and address those also.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3809 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- 4. The PIO (Headquarter), Rohit Sahota, must send the above said reply/information with a copy to this Commission, before the next hearing. Failure to comply will invite penalties as per the RTI Act 2005.
- 5. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under. Unless attested as stipulated, documents / copies supplied, shall not be accepted and regarded as an attempt to delay / deny information.

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

6. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Rohit Sabharwal,

S/o Vijay Sabharwal, # 126, Model Gram, District Ludhiana – 141 002

Versus

Public Information Officer (Headquarters), o/o Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Municipal Corporation, District Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3811 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Sukhwinder Kaur (for the Appellant) Surinder Singh, XEN, Zone-A (for the Respondent) Harjit Singh, SDO, Zone-B (for the Respondent) Kulwinder Singh, SDO, Zone-C (for the Respondent)

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **16.7.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information **regarding Speed Breakers in four points**, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **24.8.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **4.12.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office, Ludhiana. The appellant is represented by his lawyer Sukhwinder Kaur. The respondent PIO is represented by Surinder Singh, XEN Zone-A, Harjit Singh, SDO Zone-B, and Kulwinder Singh, SDO Zone-C. The Commission notes that separate replies have been sent to the appellant from the various zones, which has caused confusion and unnecessarily delayed the supply of the requested information. This RTI application was submitted to PIO (Headquarter), who in the present instance is, **Sh. Rohit Sahota**, Superintendent.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO (Headquarters) to file a comprehensive, written and point-wise reply, along with the requested information after attesting it in the format prescribed below.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3811 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

- 4. The PIO, Headquarter, Rohit Sahota, must send the above said reply/information with a copy to this Commission, before the next hearing. Failure to comply will invite penalty as per the RTI Act 2005.
- 5. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under. Unless attested as stipulated, documents / copies supplied, shall not be accepted and regarded as an attempt to delay / deny information.

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. <u>Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.</u>

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Rohit Sabharwal,

S/o Vijay Sabharwal, # 126, Model Gram, District Ludhiana – 141 002

Versus

Public Information Officer, o/o Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana. First Appellate Authority, o/o Municipal Corporation, District Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 3812 of 2020 and 3814 of 2020 (Heard together via Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Sukhwinder Kaur (for the Appellant) Charanjit Singh, PIO-cum-Superintendent (for the Respondent) 99880-14569

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI applications dated **25.8.2020 and 1.9.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information <u>regarding Letter No. Council/Comp./1469/38 dated 27.6.2020</u>, as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **5.10.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **4.12.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. The appellant is represented by his lawyer Sukwinder Kaur. The respondent PIO, represented by Charanjit Singh, superintendent stated that a reply vide his Letter No. 128 had informed the appellant that the complaint cited in the RTI application, has been sent to the STP on the orders of the Commissioner, Municipal Corporation. The respondent submitted that the said complaint is still under process before a committee constituted by the Mayor of Ludhiana.
- 3. The respondent PIO is directed to submit a duly notarised affidavit enumerating the exact status of the information requested in this RTI application. The original affidavit is to be given to the appellant and a copy to be sent to this Commission before the next hearing.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3812 of 2020 and 3814 of 2020 (Heard together via Video Conference Proceedings)

4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under. Unless attested as stipulated, documents / copies supplied, shall not be accepted and regarded as an attempt to delay / deny information.

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Gagnish Singh Khurana,

S/o Mohinder Singh Khurana, # 180/B-XXIII, Tej Nagar, Bagh Suffian, District Ludhiana – 141 003

Versus

Public Information Officer,

o/o Divisional Forest Officer, H-J, 693, New Professor Colony, Opposite West End Mall, Ferozepur Road, District Ludhiana-141012 First Appellate Authority, o/o Conservator of Forests, South Circle, Opposite District Jail, District Patiala-147001

Appeal Case No. 3946 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

PRESENT:

Gagnish Singh Khurana (Appellant) 98144-19611 Jsagroop Singh, Superintendent (for the Respondent) 88724-00493

ORDER:

- 1. The RTI application is dated **23.7.2020** vide which the appellant has sought information regarding the action plan for 'Clean Air Ludhiana', as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (FAA) on **2.9.2020**, and second appeal was filed in the Commission on **8.12.2020** under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005. Notice to the parties for first hearing was issued on **5.3.2021**.
- 2. Both parties are present through the Video Conference Facility at the Deputy Commissioner's Office in Ludhiana. The appellant stated that the information provided by the respondent PIO vide Letter No.6867 dated 4.2.2021, was deficient and that he has listed the deficiencies to the respondent PIO.
- 3. This Commission directs the respondent PIO to submit a copy of the reply sent to the appellant as well as copies of all the information supplied after duly attesting them as per the format given below. The respondent also directed to examine the deficiencies listed by the appellant and address these, or, cite reasons/provisions of the RTI Act where information is not available or he/she seeks exemption from disclosure.

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden, Madhya Marg, Sector 16, Chandigarh. Ph: 0172-2864111, Visit us @ www.infocommpunjab.com, Email:psic21@punjabmail.gov.in



Appeal Case No. 3946 of 2020 (Video Conference Proceedings)

4. IMPORTANT! All documents / information supplied to appellants / complainants must mandatorily be attested as under:

Information supplied under the RTI Act, 2005 Signature of the PIO Name of the PIO Name of the Public Authority Date

5. Next hearing on 2.7.2021 at 11.00 am through Video Conference Facility in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana.

Sd/(ASIT JOLLY)
State Information Commissioner, Punjab.